UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

United States of America)	
)	
v.)	
)	CRIMINAL NO. 05CR10214MLV
Florentino Ruidiaz, Jr.)	
)	

<u>DEFENDANT FLORENTINO RUIDIAZ'S MOTION TO SUPPRESS</u> WEAPON AND AMMUNITION

Defendant, Florentino Ruidiaz, respectfully requests that this Honorable Court suppress the weapon and ammunition that the government intends to produce as evidence because they were seized as a result of an unlawful search. This request is made pursuant to the Fourth Amendment of the United States Constitution, which protects individuals from unreasonable search and seizure; Florida v. J.L., 529 U.S. 266 (2000); Terry v. Ohio, 392 U.S. 1 (1968); United States v. Galab, 325 F.3d 63 (1st Cir 2003); United States v. Stanley, 915 F.2d 54 (1st Cir. 1990); United States v. Espinoza, 433 F.Supp.2d 186 (D. Mass 2006); United States v. Romain, 393 F.3d 63 (1st Cir 2004); United States v. McKoy, 402 F.Supp.2d 311 (D. Mass 2004) aff'd 428 F.3d 38 (1st Cir 2005)); United States v. Hart 334 F.Supp.2d 5 (D. Mass 2003).

In support hereof, the defendant relies upon a separate memorandum of law, transcripts, and affidavit.

Respectfully Submitted, Florentino Ruidiaz, Jr. By his attorney,

/s/ Robert S. Sinsheimer B.B.O No. 464940 Denner Pellegrino, LLP 4 Longfellow Place, 35th Floor Boston, MA 02114 617-722-9954

Dated: September 29, 2006

Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that this document filed through the ECF System will be sent electronically to the registered participants as identified on the Notice of Electronic Filing (NEF) and paper copies will be sent to those indicated as non-registered participants on September 29, 2006.

/s/ Robert S. Sinsheimer

RUIDIAZ REVISED TRANSCRIPT

11

911: Call's recorded, what is your emergency?

Caller: Yeah, um, I was out there chillin'.

911: There's what?

Caller: I was, I was inside my the house.

911: Yup.

Caller: And then, then, some neighbor or I don't know where they're coming from,

they're shooting in the air with a gun, um, [inaudible]

911: They're shooting a gun? Where are you sir?

Caller: Um, French Ave.

911: French Ave?

Caller: Yep. [inaudible]

911: Can you see who's doing it? Your phone is, you're phone is terrible, I can barely

hear you. You're on French Ave and somebody's shooting a gun off in the air?

Caller: Yeah.

911: Can you see them?

Caller: Yeah, I think.

911: You did? Okay. Were they in a car?

Caller: They, they're out there right now. In a Benz.

911: They're outside in a what?

Caller: Huh, they're out there.

911: Sir?

Caller:

They drive a Benz.

911:

A van?

Caller:

No a Benz. Mercedes Benz.

911:

A Mercedes Benz?

Caller:

Yep.

911:

What color is it?

Caller:

Green.

911:

What color? Green?

Caller:

Yup.

911:

Okay, hold on a second.

Caller:

[inaudible]

[Background conversation]

911:

Can you see a plate?

Caller:

Hmm?

911:

Can you see a plate...on the car? Are you right near it?

Caller:

No, I can't see it clearly.

911:

Ok, so French Ave. What number, French Ave? Or, or, what area?

Caller:

126. They're deep [inaudible]. That's where they live.

911:

136 French Ave?

Caller:

126.

911:

126?

Caller:

Yeah. They're deep.

[simultaneously]

911: Okay.

911: 126 French Ave, there's a green Mercedes shooting off guns. Green.

Caller: They're deep.

911: They what?

Caller: They got a Benz. They're deep, like a lot of people, like, you know what I'm

saying, they're in the Benz, and then 126, they got a gun, it's at the house.

911: Okay.

[simultaneously]

Caller: I live next door.

911: Okay. Which, which, can you tell which person has, can you tell me which person

has the gun? What they look like? Any clothing description?

Caller: I'm not, I'm not sure 'cause all of 'em got a red shirt. All of 'em.

911: All of them have red shirts?

Caller: Yeah.

911: Okay.

Caller: I can tell.

911: Okay.

Caller: But I can't remember any of the faces, you know what I'm saying?

911: Yep. Um,

Caller: I just make sure everything is set [inaudible],

911: Okay. How many gunshots, do you know how many shots they shot, they fired

off?

Caller: Huh?

[simultaneously]

911: How many gun shots did they shoot off?

Caller: Um, they got a 38 cause they shoot, they shoot two times.

911: They shot three times?

Caller: Two times.

911: Two times?

Caller: with a thirty-eight

911: Two times with a thirty-eight?

Caller: Yep.

911: Ok. All right, we'll send somebody out there to check 'em, ok?

Caller: Yeah, I ain't going, I ain't gonna be out there.

911: No, I know. I know.

Caller: You know what I'm saying? I just call you guys [inaudible]

911: Yeah, yeah, if we have to though we can call you back though, right? Just in case

we need to ask you anything?

Caller: All right.

911: Ok. 6-3-1-1-ah-2-3-9-4?

Caller: Yup.

911: Ok.

Caller: All right.

911: All right, thank you.

UM: 9-1-1, this call is recorded, what is your emergency?

UF: I need an ambulance at...

UM:

Let me connect you over to medical, ma'am.

UF:

Thank you. Hold on.

UM:

Mmhmm.

UF: UM:

7-6 to Brockton.

UM:

Go ahead.

UM:

Okay, ah, located the child, clear it 10-5, we're riding up 31 to the area of

North Main and Elliot. One adult female. 137-2-2-5 the mileage.

UM:

0-0-12?

UM:

Officer Robert Smith....

[Pause]

UM:

Officer Robert Smith, 8-4-3.

Dispatch 1:

8-2-9?

Hyland:

Come in, sir, we're at the park.

Dispatch 1:

French Ave. Blue Mercedes, ah, for gun shots. Or, green Mercedes. Firing, ah,

weapons out of the car. 126 French Ave.

Hyland:

Received from Oak Street.

Dispatch 1:

South Impact, are you on the road?

Shanks:

We'll be clear in a second. Go ahead.

Dispatch 1:

We have a green Mercedes down on French Ave firing off, ah, weapons.

Shanks:

A green Mercedes on French Ave? Okay.

[Pause]

UM:

Ah, cancel that.

Dispatch 2:

Brockton 4 to 12, Officer Robert Smith, 8-43.

UM:

Go ahead.

Dispatch 2:

All right, sir.

Dispatch 1:

Units going to french Ave, ah, the green Mercedes is still there, it's out front. Ah, the caller thinks they live there. All parties involved have red shirts on and there

were, ah, two shots, I believe, two shots fired.

Shanks:

We have that.

Hyland:

2-9 has it as well.

UM:

South door.

Hyland:

Brockton, 8-2-9, going out.

Dispatch 1:

Ok, do you want a twenty?

Hyland:

Negative, thank you.

Nazaire:

Brockton, put 1-3 out with them.

Dispatch 1:

Ok.

Hyland:

Brockton, the Mercedes has Mass Reg 2-2-Yankee-Kilo-3-1.

Hyland:

Keith are you still in the garage?

Shanks:

Yeah.

Hyland:

I'll be right there.

UM:

The door's open.

UM:

8-7-7 to a street supervisor.

[Pause]

Hallisy:

Ok. Ah, someone calling a street sup?

UM:

Channel two, please.

Dispatch 1:

8-2-9?

[Pause]

Dispatch 1:

8-2-9 or 8-1-3?

UM:

Go ahead.

Dispatch 1:

It comes back active on a Mercedes, green. Carmen Andrade out of Martland

Ave.

Benvie:

Joe, you know who called this in?

Dispatch 2: Standby, Officer Benvie, let me check....

[Pause]

Dispatch 2: Officer Benvie?

Benvie:

Go ahead.

Dispatch 2: Called in by a neighbor. We do have a call back.

Benvie:

Yeah, can you call him back? We'd like to talk to him.

[Pause]

Benvie: Joe, assign a case number, we've got one in custody. We have a code'4.

Dispatch 2: All right, sir.

Dispatch 2: Officer Benvie, nextel please, Officer Benvie.

Benvie:

Standby.

Benvie:

Officer Pizzi?

Dispatch 2: Go ahead, sir.

Benvie:

Just want to verify 5-0-8-6-3-1-2-3-9-4.

Dispatch 2: Standby, Officer Benvie, I'm on another screen right now.

[Pause]

Dispatch 2: Officer Benvie?

Benvie:

Go ahead.

Benvie:

Yeah, Joe, I just want to verify that I'm at 5-0-8...standby.

[Pause - Background Noise]

UM:

7-7 to Brockton.

UM:

33 and suspect just pulled up, two on the drive. I'll get back to you.

UM:

Brockton, give us a signal 20 at, ah, Packard and Main, we're out with a

vehicle that has that gun.

Dispatch 1: 20 on 1, 20 on 1.

Dispatch 1: Any units at 827 Main on two?...

[Pause]

Dispatch 1: All right, you're talking about Packard and Main?

UM: Okay

UM: Yeah, we talked to the 33, but we're out with them right now....

[Pause]

UM: Yup, we went out with them, we talked to them, there was no pointing a

weapon or anything like that. Now we just got to grab the car quick

before it got away.

UM: Brockton you can cancel that 20.

UM: All right, sir, thank you.

Benvie: 2-niner-2

Dispatch 2: 29 come in....

[Pause]

Dispatch 2: 8-2-9 come in.

Benvie: Joe, you got a status on this, ah, Mercedes 2-2-Y-Yankee-K-Kilo-3-1? 2-2-Y-K-

3-1?

Dispatch 2: Showing it active. It's out of, ah, Martland Ave, Brockton. To a Carmen

Andrade. Passed inspection.

Dispatch 2: Brockton alternate to 800.

[Pause]

Dispatch 2: Brockton alternate to 800.

UF: 800 ready to copy

Dispatch 2: 10-14, stolen, recovered motor vehicle; be from Mass reg 22-A-alpha-T-

tango-23; that's 2-2-Alpha-Tango-2-3. That's on a '97 Ford Escort, color red. It's located at 22 Pleasant Street, 2-2 Pleasant. Your cruiser will be

8-7-6, log time of 0-0-3-6.

UF: Sir, that was 60 pleasant?

Dispatch 2: Twenty-two.

UF: I'm sorry you kept cutting out, what's the address again?

Dispatch 2: 2-2 Pleasant Street

[Pause]

Dispatch 1: Packard and Main?

Dispatch 1: The, ah, the caller from earlier is now stating two males just ran into the

apartment, you guys were in at 827 Main. She ran upstairs.

UM: 7-6 to 1.

UM: Go ahead.

UM: Can you call fire, there's a man's down over here where I'm at. At 2-2

Pleasant, complaining of a leg injury.

UM: All right.

Shanks: Go ahead on French.

Shanks: 827 Main, what floor was it?

UM: Brockton, 8-3-1 or 8-3-9 back on 827 Main

Dispatch 2: Received, you're on two, sir.

Benvie: 2-9 to a street supervisor?

Hallisy: Go ahead, I'm in the station.

Benvie: Please.

Hallisy: Okay, repeat.

Dispatch 1: Channel two, Lieu.

Benvie: Yes sir. We got a, ah, vehicle, ah, got a 10-12 out of it with a code 4, it's parked

up on the sidewalk, creating a hazard. The owner's not around. Is it all right for

a 10-12?

Hallisy: Okay on two. Go ahead with it.

Benvie: Sir we got a, ah, 10-12 out of a vehicle that's parked up on the sidewalk creating a

hazard. We can't find the owner. Is it all right for a 10-12?

Hallisy: 10-4?

Benvie: My mistake, sorry for a tow. Joe, you copy that?

Dispatch 2: Yes sir, I do. Brockton alternate to 800?

UF: Ready to copy

Dispatch 2: Yes, ma'am. 10-14. Ah, motor vehicle hazard for Mass reg 2-2-Y-Yankee K-

Kilo-3-1. That's on a '93 Mercedes, color green, it is located at Packard and Main, Packard and Main. Your cruiser will be, ah, Officer Benvie, are you going

to handle this or 8-3-9?

UF: What's the last two letters of the license plate; please?

Dispatch 2: 800 standby, please.

Dispatch 2: 8-29, Officer Benvie on two.

Hyland: Go for Benvie.

Dispatch 2: All right, is this going to be your tow, sir, or 8-3-9's?

Hyland: 8-2-9, I'm out with it.

Dispatch 2: All right.

Dispatch 2: 800?

UF: Ready.

Dispatch 2: Plate number is 2-2-Yankee-Kilo-3-1, Mass 2-2-Yankee-Kilo-3-1. It's on a '93

Mercedes, color green. It's located at Packard and Main, Packard and Main

Streets. Cruiser will be 8-2-9. Log time of 0-0-4-7.

UF: Received.

End - Time 16min 48 sec.

Case 1:05-cr-10214-MLW Document 40-3 Filed 09/29/2006 Page	e_1 of 3
! Case ! Case	No.
! BROCKTON POLICE DEPARTMENT ! ! UNL POSS FIREARM ! ARREST REPORT !	05008637
! Offense Date and Time ! Day ! Arrest Date and Time ! Day ! Dom ! 07/17/2005 00:30 ! Sun ! 07/17/2005 00:30 ! Sun !	estic Violence? NO
! Location of Offense ! Apt ! Sector ! Wrd ! Prec ! Arrest ! 126/FRENCH AV ! ! SW ! 3 ! 3B ! HYLAND	ing Officer , THOMAS
! Defendant's Name	. ! A/J ! /1980 ! ADULT !
! Defendant's Address ! Social Secur ! 126/FRENCH AV BROCKTON MA ! 01062729	
! Offense(s) Charged A! B! ! UNL POSS FIREARM ! UNL POSS AMMUNITIO !	C !
! Weapon(s) Used ! Location of Arrest ! .357 MAGNUM ! 126/FRENCH AV	,
! Type of Property ! Make ! Model ! Color 1 ! Color 1 ! Color 1 ! FIREARMS/ACCESSORI ! ROSSI ! .357 MAGNU! BLK ! SI	r 2 ! Value ! L ! \$!
Type of Property ! Make ! Model ! Color 1 ! Color FIREARMS/ACCESSORI ! S&W, CCI ! .357,38SPL ! SIL ! BR	
Witness 1 ! Sex ! Race ! D.O.B HYLAND THOMAS ! U ! U !	! !
Residence Address ! Res Telephone ! BROCKTON POLICE DEPT ! !	Bus Telephone ! 5.08 941 0200 !
Witness 2 ! Sex ! Race ! D.O.B ! BENVIE BRIAN ! U ! U !	! !
Residence Address ! Res Telephone ! EROCKTON POLICE DEPT !	Bus Telephone ! 508 941 0200 !
Witness 3 ! Sex ! Race ! D.O.B ! CARDE SAMUEL ! U ! U !	
Residence Address ! Res Telephone ! EROCKTON POLICE DEPT !' !	Bus Telephone ! 508 941 0200 !
Witness 4 ! Sex ! Race ! D.O.B ! PAUL NAZAIRE ! U ! U ! ! ! ! !	•
Residence Address ! Res Telephone ! EROCKTON POLICE DEPT ! !	Bus Telephone ! 508 941 0200 !
State & Reg. ! Year ! Make ! Model ! Color ! Vehicle ID Number MA 22YK31 ! 93 ! MERZ ! 300 ! GRN ! WDBEB28E1PB928960	1 1
Narrative:	1

Case 1:05-cr-10244-MLW Document 40-3 Filed 09/29/2006 Page 2 of 3 Page

Offense/Incident ! . Case No.

! BROCKTON POLICE DEPARTMENT UNL POSS FIREARM ! ARREST REPORT

05008637

1 ! Officer Benvie and I, Officer Hyland, were assigned to the impact ! 2 ! shift on 7/17/05 when we were dispatched to 126 French Av for reports 3 ! of gunshots. We were informed from the dispatcher that gunshots were 4 ! coming from a green Mercedes parked in front of 126 French Av. We 5 ! saw the green Mercedes in front of 126 French Av when we arrived. 6 ! The passenger door to the vehicle was open. Officer Benvie and I 7 ! approached the open door and illuminated the interior of the vehicle 8 ! with our flashlights. I saw Defendant Florentino Ruidiaz sitting in 9 ! the front passenger seat. His head was cradled awkwardly against the 10 ! head rest and his arms were wrapped around his torso. His eyes were 11 ! closed. I feared he may have been shot.

I touched Defendant Ruidiaz's right shoulder and asked if he was 13 ! okay. He replied, "You fucking okay?" belligerently. This response 14 ! both surprised me and heightened my suspicion that Defendant Ruidiaz 15 ! could, in fact, be armed and dangerous. I took hold of Defendant 16 ! Ruidiaz's right forearm and asked him to exit the vehicle. I wanted 17 ! to pat-frisk Defendant Ruidiaz for weapons. I felt muscular tension 18 ! in Defendant Ruidiaz's forearm as he exclaimed, "What the fuck do you 19 ! want me out of the car for! " I pulled Defendant Ruidiaz out of the 20 ! vehicle, a green Mercedes bearing MA reg# 22YK31, and guided him to 21 ! the pavement. Officer Benvie took hold of Defendant Ruidiaz's left 22 ! arm while Detective Nazaire Paul pat-frisked the subject. Detective 23 ! Paul found a silver .357 Magnum tucked in the front waistband of 24 ! Defendant Ruidiaz's pants. I immediately handcuffed (DL) Defendant 25 ! Ruidiaz and placed him in the rear of my cruiser. Detective Paul 26 ! handed the .357 to Detective Carde. The handgun was fully-loaded with 27 ! 6 live rounds. Detective Carde unloaded the handgun and gave it to me.

I checked the yards and street around the Mercedes for ballistic 29 ! evidence, but none was found. Officer Benvie conveyed to Lieutenant 30 ! Hallisey that the vehicle was posing a hazard, parked so as to block 31 ! the sidewalk, and requested the vehicle be towed. He also informed 32 ! Lieutenant Hallisey that the armed defendant was found in the vehicle 33 ! and no operator was available to move it. Lieutenant Hallisey 34 ! authorized the tow of the Mercedes.

I advised Defendant Ruidiaz of his Miranda Rights while en route 36 ! to the police station at 7 Commercial St. Defendant Ruidiaz 37 ! acknowledged understanding these rights by saying, "Yeah. No shit." 38 ! I asked Defendant Ruidiaz where he got the handgun. Defendnat Ruidiaz 39 ! exclaimed, "You had no probable cause to search me. I'm gonna beat 40 ! this shit. I'll get a year mandatory at most! I'll do the year."

41 ! We arrived at 7 Commercial St and escorted Defendant Ruidiaz from 42 ! the cruiser to the booking room. While en route to the booking room, 43 ! Officer Benvie asked Defendant Ruidiaz why he was carrying the gun. 44 ! Defendant Ruidiaz reached around and pulled his shirt over his belly. 45 ! I saw numerous scars. He replied, "I've been stabbed. Why do you 46 ! think?" Defendant Ruidiaz was booked without further incident.

Upon closer examination of the hangun and its rounds, I found 48 ! the qun to be manufactured by INTERARMS. Three of the six rounds were 49 ! hollow-point CCI .357 Magnum rounds. The other three were S & W .38 50 ! Special rounds. The .357 Magnum handgun had a serial number of: 51 ! 074426. I querried this number via LEAPS to make sure the firearm was

	1 1 Contract of the second of
	2 - 45
IN THE UNITED STATES DI	ISTRICT COURT (5
DISTRICT OF MASSAC	්ලිර _ි ් CHUSETTS
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,))
Plaintiff,)
vs. FLORENTINO RUIDIAZ, JR.,) CRIMINAL ACTION NO.) 05-10214-MLW)
Defendant.)

THE VIDEOTAPED DEPOSITION OF BRIAN BENVIE, held pursuant to Order, and the applicable provisions of the Federal Rules of Criminal Procedure, before Jeffrey Mocanu a Court Reporter and Notary Public, within and for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, at the offices of the United States Attorney, 1 Courthouse Way, Boston, Massachusetts, on Wednesday, July 19, 2006, commencing at 2:23 p.m.



APPEARANCES:

For the Plaintiff:

JAMES E. ARNOLD, ESQ.
SUSAN M. POSWISTILO, ESQ.
Assistant U.S. Attorneys
Office of the United States Attorney
1 Courthouse Way
Boston, MA 02210
(617) 748-3100

For the Defendant:

ROBERT SINSHEIMER, ESQ. Denner & Associates Four Longfello Pl Boston, MA 02114

Also Present:

Matthew Stavris, Paralegal

S/A Sheila O'Hara

S/A Jim Mattson

Florentino Ruidiaz, Jr.

			3
	<u>I</u> NDEX		
WITNESS:		Ī	PAGE
Brian Ben	vie		
(by Mr.	Arnold)	6/37	7/43
(by Mr.	Sinsheimer)	28	3/40
EXHIBIT	DESCRIPTION	Ē	PAGE
No. 5	Photograph	11	13
No. 6	Notebook	25	27
No. 7	Arrest report and booking sheet	31	

PROCEEDINGS

(2:23 p.m.)

BRIAN BENVIE, having been sworn by a Notary Public to tell the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the truth, testified upon his oath as follows:

EXAMINATION BY MR. ARNOLD:

Q Will you please state your name and spell your last name?

A Brian Benvie.

MR. SINSHEIMER: Excuse me, Mr. Arnold. I didn't realize you were going to begin by just asking questions. I mean, I'd like to make a statement for the record, if I may, please.

MR. ARNOLD: Sure.

MR. SINSHEIMER: Thank you. First of all, obviously, there's no judge here, so I think we need to have a method of objecting and my proposal is a common one that all objections, save to the form of the question, be reserved until the time of trial. Do you have any problem with that?

MR. ARNOLD: I would prefer that you state your objection on the record now and then the witness will answer and then it will be redacted.

MR. SINSHEIMER: Well, I'm glad I put it on the record then. I'm not sure I agree that that's necessary,

C

but I will -- I'm certainly not going to argue objections on the record, but if there's an objection, I'll do my best to make them. I still wish to reserve all my objections to the time of trial, understanding you oppose that, except as to the form, which I agree.

MR. ARNOLD: Understood.

MR. SINSHEIMER: The second thing I wanted to point out is that this order entered before I became counsel for Mr. Ruidiaz, so I just -- I didn't go back and try to contest it, but I just emphasize that this is pursuant to an order, that we never sent it to. My client is here because he has to be here, for no other purpose at this juncture. And I think in light of the fact that we might have considered calling this witness for suppression type purposes, that that might be an issue that comes up at some point in the course of this deposition.

MR. ARNOLD: That's fine. Anything else?

MR. SINSHEIMER: Thank you. Thank you for giving me the opportunity.

MS. POSWISTILO: Reswear him?

MR. ARNOLD: Yeah. I'd like -- do you mind if we have him re -- so that -- you got your objections before the deposition started, but do you mind now for clarity of purpose, in terms of the trial transcript, that we have the witness resworn?

Were you on duty the night of July 16th, 2005, Q 1 2 morning of July 17th, 2005? 3 Yes, I was. Α 4 Officer Benvie, what shift were you on that night? 5 A We were working an impact shift. 6 0 What is the impact shift? 7 Α Impact shift is a shift designed to specifically 8 target Priority 1 calls. 9 MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection, move to strike. 10 0 BY MR. ARNOLD: And what are Priority 1 calls? 11 Priority 1 calls are calls that are in progress, 12 B&Es, gunshots, rape in progress type things. No reports. 13 Who was your partner during that impact shift on 14 the night of July 16th, morning of July 17th, 2005? 15 Α Officer Thomas Highland. 16 What hours were you and Officer Highland on duty 17 on the impact shift? 18 I believe it was 2000 to zero four. During the impact shift on the morning of July 19 20 17th, 2005, did you have a reason to go to 126 French Avenue in Brockton, Massachusetts? 21 22 Α . Yes, we did. 23 Why did you go to 126 French Avenue? 0 24 Dispatch ---Α 25 MR. SINSHEIMER: Ah -- well, I don't object to the

form of the question, but since, you know, there's no judge 1 here, if it calls for hearsay answer, I'm going to preserve 2 any rights I may have. 3 Go ahead. 4 Dispatch called us for a call of gunshots at that 5 address, 126 French Ave. 6 7 MR. SINSHEIMER: Move to strike. BY MR. ARNOLD: What other ---8 0 MR. SINSHEIMER: Move to -- I move to strike for 9 10 trial, not necessarily for suppression. We better sort of make that -- move to strike for trial. 11 12 BY MR. ARNOLD: Did dispatch provide any 13 additional information to you, other than qunshots were being fired at 126 French Avenue? 14 15 Α Yes. 16 MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection. He said that -- yes. He said there was a green 17 Α 18 Mercedes parked out in front of the house and was firing. 19 0 BY MR. ARNOLD: Approximately, what time was it when you received the dispatch call? 20 21 Say roughly around 12:30. 22 Now were you familiar with the area around 126 French Avenue? 23 24 Α Yes. 25 What's the basis for your familiarity with that Q

area?

- A Prior calls. That's one of the areas --MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection.
- A --- targeted ---

MR. SINSHEIMER: Oops, sorry. Go ahead. I apologize.

A Prior calls. It is a, one of the areas targeted for the south cruiser on the impact shift. It's an area known for drugs, prostitution, guns, gang, gang related violence.

MR. SINSHEIMER: I object and move to strike. I didn't object to the question because I thought the answer was going to be routine patrol. I think the question was: How are you familiar with the area? I move to strike the response, which is highly prejudicial and unfair.

- Q BY MR. ARNOLD: In lieu of the objection, what kind of -- based on your familiarity with the area, what kind of area is it?
 - A It's a high-crime area.

MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection, move to strike.

- Q BY MR. ARNOLD: Approximately how long did it take from the time that you received the dispatch call until you arrived with Officer Highland as 126 French Avenue?
- A Five minutes, tops. We were on one side of the city and it doesn't take that long to get to the other side.

10 So roughly five minutes. 1 I may have asked you this, but approximately what 2 time was it when you received the original dispatch call? 3 I believe it was around 12:30. 4 When you arrived at 126 French Avenue, what did 5 6 you see? 7 There was a green Mercedes parked in front of Α 126 French Ave. It was parked on the -- facing the wrong 8 9 direction. It was partially on the sidewalk and the passenger door was open, all the way open. 10 And could you see an individual in the vehicle at 11 Q that time? 12 No, I couldn't. Α 13 14 I want to show you what has been marked for 15 identification purposes as Government's Exhibit 5. (The document referred to was 16 marked for identification as 17 Government's Exhibit No. 5.) 18 BY MR. ARNOLD: What is this? 19 Q This is 126 French Ave. 20 Α 21 Is this a fair and accurate depiction of the street in front of 126 French Avenue? 22 Yes, sir. 23 Α Now I'd like to show you what's an enlargement of 24 Govern -- mh? 25

11 (Pause.) 1 MR. ARNOLD: I'm going to move to admit Government 2 Exhibit 5. 3 MR. SINSHEIMER: At this point, the rec -- it does 4 5 -- you haven't said anything about the car and the testimony is only that it's a fair and accurate representation of the 6 7 location. I do think that before I can assent, we need to hear something about what this car is. 8 BY MR. ARNOLD: Looking at the vehicle that's 9 Q depicted in Government Exhibit 5, was that vehicle -- do you 10 know -- do you recall whether that vehicle was present? 11 I don't recall that, no. Α 12 But for the vehicle that is appearing in 13 14 Government Exhibit 5, is it a fair and accurate depiction of 15 what you saw? Obviously, it doesn't have the green Mercedes. 16 17 Α Yes. And it was nighttime? 18 Q 19 Α It was nighttime, yes. But is it an accurate depiction of the street in 20 Q front of 125 French -- 126 French Avenue? 21 22 Α Yes. 23 MR. ARNOLD: And I'd move to admit. MR. SINSHEIMER: No objection. 24 25 (Government's Exhibit No. 5 marked

(617) 426-3077

I think this guy is dead.

14 MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection. Move to strike. 1 Anything past "appeared to be dead." 2 BY MR. ARNOLD: Will you describe how the 3 Q individual in the vehicle was situated that led you to 4 believe that the individual appeared to be dead? 5 He was in an awkward position in the seat and his 6 head was tilted, his mouth was open. When I shined my light 7 on him, which is a fairly bright light, there was no 8 response. And then at that point I told Officer Highland 9 that this guy looks like he's dead. And Officer ---10 MR. SINSHEIMER: Move to strike, again. 11 Then Officer Highland came up to the vehicle, he 12 Α 13 shined his light ---MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection. Objection. Now I'm 14 objecting on the grounds, I mean, it's unresponsive. 15 There's no judge here, but maybe we should put another 16 question, respectfully. 17 MR. ARNOLD: Fine. 18 19 MR. SINSHEIMER: Thank you. BY MR. ARNOLD: After you saw -- when you shone --20 Q 21 when you shone your flashlight on the individual, did the individual move? 22 А 23 No. 24 Q Did his eyes open? 25 Α No. APEX Reporting

(617) 426-3077

Q After you shone your flashlight on the individual sitting in the passenger seat of the green Mercedes, what did you do next?

A That's when I turned around and I mentioned to Officer Highland ---

MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection. Objection.

Q BY MR. ARNOLD: Continue.

A --- that, hey, this guy appears to be dead. And by that time Officer Highland was at the passenger side of the door.

Q What happened next?

б

A Officer Highland then, being the contact officer, shone his light in on the suspect. He asked him if he was okay. He nudged him on the shoulder. He asked him if he was okay. From that point on, I don't know what the response -- I didn't hear a response out of the -- out of the person sitting in the front seat. And then at that point Officer Highland took him by the right arm, right shoulder area, and pulled him out of the car and guided him to the ground.

Q When Officer Highland was having contact with the individual in the vehicle, where were you physically?

A I was to the rear of the driver -- of the -- not the driver, of the passenger post of the car. If there was a second door, I don't remember if it was a two-door or a

arrived on the scene, came up, pat frisked him around the

25

17 waistband, reached in and pulled out a gun, showed us the 1 2 qun. 3 And what did Officer Paul do with the gun that he 4 pulled out from the individual's waistband? 5 I don't -- I don't recall what he did with the gun 6 at that time. 7 What did you and Officer Highland do with the 0 individual after the gun was located from the waistband? 8 9 We placed him in handcuffs, then we escorted him Α back to the cruiser. We put him in the backseat of the 10 cruiser. 11 Now, do you see the person in this room whom you 12 0 arrested at 126 French Avenue and who was in possession of 13 the gun? 14 15 Α Yes. 16 MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection. 17 Α Yes. 18 Q BY MR. ARNOLD: Rephrase the question. Do you see 19 the person in the room whom you arrested at 126 French Avenue? 20 21 Α Yes. 22 MR. SINSHEIMER: That objection, I still object. 23 I object solely on the grounds of suggestiveness that he was 24 -- five of us here. There's no opportunity for -- excuse 25 me, I'm counting.

MR. ARNOLD: Seven.

MR. SINSHEIMER: Seven or eight people. He's sitting next to me, he was brought in by marshals in front of this witness, for what it's worth, and I'm making an objection for the record. That's all.

- Q BY MR. ARNOLD: And why did you arrest the defendant at that time?
 - A For possession of a handgun and ammunition.
- Q At some point after you and Officer Highland arrested the defendant, you said you put the defendant in the cruiser; is that correct?
 - A Yes.

Q And what was the defendant's demeanor when you put him in the cruiser?

A He was agitated, he went from a state of calm to being extremely agitated and then back to calm. His emotions were running all over. He was -- he was thrashing about in the backseat. He was yelling, I'll do my one-year mando, I'll my one year mando, I don't have a problem with doing one year, one year is nothing to me, phrases like that.

MR. SINSHEIMER: I'll move to strike. The question was what his demeanor was, not what he was saying.

Q BY MR. ARNOLD: What did the defendant say?

MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection, Mr. Arnold.

	·
1	Q BY MR. ARNOLD: What did the defendant say after
2	you put him in the cruiser?
3	MR. SINSHEIMER: I understand that you don't think
4	it's a valid objection, but I'm objecting, again, just for.
5	Q BY MR. ARNOLD: Again, what did the defendant say?
6	A He was he was yelling that he'll do his
7	one-year mando.
8	MR. SINSHEIMER: Again, and I did object, but I
9	just what happened wasn't stopped.
10	Go ahead. I'm sorry. I apologize, Officer.
11	THE WITNESS: Oh, that's no problem.
12	Q BY MR. ARNOLD: Again, I'm going to ask, for the
13	record purposes, for clarity of the record, what did
14	MR. ARNOLD: And your objection is noted.
15	MR. SINSHEIMER: Thank you.
16	Q BY MR. ARNOLD: What did the defendant say after
17	being placed in the cruiser?
18	A He was saying he'll do his one-year mando, he has
19	no problem with doing one year. One year is nothing.
20	MR. SINSHEIMER: Move to strike.
21	Q BY MR. ARNOLD: When the defendant said, I'll do
22	his one-year mando, what did you understand that to mean?
23	A I understand that to mean that in the Commonwealth
24	of Massachusetts unlicensed possession of a firearm requires
25	a one-year mandatory prison sentence.
'	' APEX Reporting '

APEX Reporting (617) 426-3077

you arrested the defendant, did you and Officer Highland

transport the defendant ---

24

25

21 Yes. 1 Α 2 Q --- away from 126 French Avenue? Yes, we did. 3 Α And at the time of arrest or thereafter, was the 4 Q defendant given his Miranda warnings? 5 He was. On the way to the station Officer 6 Α 7 Highland informed him of his Miranda rights. 0 After the defend -- and did the defendant 8 acknowledge his Miranda rights? 9 Α He did. 10 Q Do you recall how he acknowledged them? 11 MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection. I object. 12 Α No, I don't. I know he did answer to it, though, 13 14 that he did answer, recognize them. BY MR. ARNOLD: After receiving his Miranda 15 rights, did the defendant make any statements? 16 MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection. This objection is 17 based not on the form of the question or anything on the 18 fact that there's likely going to be a suppression motion, 19 this is putting the cart before the horse, so if you let me 20 have what we call a running objection, I won't beat the 21 22 record up any more. MR. ARNOLD: Why don't we do that? 23 MR. SINSHEIMER: Okay. So we are -- I'm objecting 24 25 to any statements until such time as I've had an opportunity

MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection.

25

A --- dispatcher that there was an anonymous phone call on the 911 tape. They did have a phone number. I got the phone number from the dispatcher and I called that phone number. The person on the other end wouldn't identify himself. He wouldn't tell us where he was, but he did say that he was watching us. He said the person we have is the correct person that was firing the shots. And then he hung up.

MR. SINSHEIMER: I object, move to strike.

A I wanted to ask him other questions so I called him back. He didn't answer the phone. About two minutes after that, after I hung up the phone, he called me back. I again tried to get his identity. He said that he wouldn't give up his identity. He told me he was in the blue house next door. He gave the address. I can't remember what the address was. He was in the basement apartment. There were two individuals in the driveway of this blue house, right here, leaning up against a car. I asked them if they owned the house. One of them did own the house. I asked him if he'd let me down into the cellar, into the basement and he did, and there was, there was no one down there in the basement.

MR. SINSHEIMER: Move to strike the entire answer.

Q BY MR. ARNOLD: I want to show you what's been marked as Government Exhibit 6.

	24
1	(The document referred to was
2	marked for identification as
3	Government's Exhibit No. 6.)
4	Q BY MR. ARNOLD: What is this?
5	A This is a copy of my notebook with the
6	MR. SINSHEIMER: Marked for identification at this
7	juncture only?
8	MR. ARNOLD: Marked for identification purposes
9	only.
10	MR. SINSHEIMER: At this juncture. Thank you.
11	A This is a copy of my notebook that I carry. It
12	does have a bunch of items redacted that does not that's
13	not related to this case. The three numbers on the bottom
14	of the page are the witness number that I called, and then
15	the two people that were on the vehicle.
16	Q BY MR. ARNOLD: Now, do you normally carry a note
17	pad while on duty?
18	A Yes, I do.
19	Q And what do you use it for?
20	A I use it to take notes. I write down names, do
21	FIOs, birth dates, phone numbers.
22	Q When you say FIO, what is that?
23	A Field identification. If we roll up on someone, a
24	bunch of youths hanging in the park, take down their names
25	when we encounter them, see if there are any outstanding
i	

25 warrants, that type of thing. 1 2 And you take down those notes at the time that 0 you're receiving the information? 3 Yes, I do. 4 Α 5 And do you keep your notebook thereafter in the 6 normal course of your duties? 7 Α Yes. And you indicated that there's other material 8 that's on the blacked-out portion of what's reflected as 9 Government's -- identified as Government Exhibit 6; is that 10 correct? 11 Yes. 12 Α That pertains to another -- other investigation 13 not related to this matter; is that correct? 14 That's correct, sir. 15 Α MR. ARNOLD: I'd move to admit Government 16 17 Exhibit 6 for purposes of the suppression hearing. MR. SINSHEIMER: Only? 18 19 MR. ARNOLD: Only. 20 MR. SINSHEIMER: I have no objection to it coming in for the suppression hearing. But I do object to coming 21 22 in at trial. 23 MR. ARNOLD: Understood. MR. SINSHEIMER: And it hasn't been offered at 24 trial? 25

```
26
               MR. ARNOLD: No.
 1
 2
               MR. SINSHEIMER: I understand.
 3
               MR. ARNOLD: It's only being offered for purposes
 4
               MR. SINSHEIMER: I understand.
 5
 6
               MR. ARNOLD: --- of the suppression hearing.
 7
               MR. SINSHEIMER:
                                I know when I'm being redundant.
 8
     I apologize, but I want to be clear.
 9
                               (Government's Exhibit No. 6 marked
                              for identification received into
10
11
                              evidence.)
12
               BY MR. ARNOLD: Now then, drawing your attention
     to the first note, the first item that's listed on
13
     Government Exhibit 6.
14
15
          Α
               Yes.
               What does that read?
16
          0
17
               MR. SINSHEIMER: Are we now, just again, doing
18
     suppression?
19
               MR. ARNOLD: This is strictly for the suppression
20
    hearing.
21
               MR. SINSHEIMER: No objection in that context.
22
               MR. ARNOLD: Thank you.
23
               MR. SINSHEIMER: Can I -- is that running now?
24
    Are you done with your trial testimony?
25
               MR. ARNOLD:
                            Yes.
```

27 MR. SINSHEIMER: That's pretty clear. 1 2 Thank you. First line says, witness, and then the phone 3 4 number 508-631-2394. 5 BY MR. ARNOLD: How did you get that information that says, witness, and then the telephone number that you 6 just recited? 7 8 Α That number was relayed to me by the alternate 9 dispatcher. He told me to call him. He had a phone number 10 but he didn't want to put it out over the air. 11 And what did you do then with that number? I obviously, wrote it down, and then I called it. 12 Α 13 Now those other two names and numbers that are 14 listed ---15 Α Yes. --- were those names and numbers also received 16 0 17 from dispatch? No. No, they weren't. 18 Α Those were other individuals just in the area? 19 0 20 Just in the area. Yes, sir. 21 What happened to the green Mercedes after you arrested the defendant? 22 23 Α Lieutenant Halisy authorized to tow it because it 24 was parked on the sidewalk, blocking a sidewalk, and there 25 wasn't a licensed operator to drive it away, so we towed it.

(617) 426-3077

	1	31
1	to the po	olice at the time you were taking him out of the
2	car?	
3	A	I'm sorry?
4	Q	You had you didn't have any name of anyone that
5	reported	any incident to the police at the time you were
6	taking my	client out of the car?
7	A	Correct.
8	Q	All you knew is that there was a report, shots
9	fired in	the area, right?
10	A	Yep.
11	Q	You got to the scene, correct?
12	A	Yes.
13	Q	Which is visualized in this exhibit?
14	A	Yes, sir.
15	Q	Meaning the location is visualized?
16	A	Mm-hm.
17	Q	You see a green Mercedes? Right?
18	A	Yes, sir.
19	Q	And you see somebody in the passenger seat?
20	A	No, sir. Not when we rolled up.
21	Q	Well, but at some point you see
22	A	Eventually, yes.
23	Q	him in the passenger seat?
24	A	Yes.
25	Q	And he's not committing any crimes at that time,
		APEX Reporting

		33
1	Q	So if I understand it, you're behind the front
2	passenger	door?
3	A	Yes. Yeah.
4	Q	All right. And is it light or dark out?
5	A	It was dark.
6	Q	And when Highland touches the person and I
7	would gue:	ss you visualized him reaching in, can you see that
8	in your me	emory?
9	A	Yes.
10	Q	What's he using, his left or right hand?
11	A	Oh, I don't know that.
12	Q	All right. Which way is he facing? Highland, I'm
13	talking about?	
14	A	He's facing towards the passenger.
15	Q	All right. And the what's the first reaction
16	you recall	l from the passenger?
17	A	I don't recall a reaction from the passenger. I
18	couldn't s	see him.
19	Q	Couldn't see him. Well, what's the first movement
20	that you 1	recall?
21	A	From the passenger?
22	Q	The passenger.
23	A	Couldn't see the passenger.
24	Q	Well, at some point he's taken out of the car?
25	A	Well, that's the first movement I saw was

		34
1	Q	All right. When Highland grabs him and takes him
2	out of th	ne car?
3	A	Yes.
4	Q	Okay. And before that, he didn't do anything that
5	you recal	.l seeing with your own eyes? Is that true?
6	A	That's true.
7		MR. SINSHEIMER: Give me 30 seconds.
8		(Pause.)
9	Q	BY MR. SINSHEIMER: He was wearing a black shirt,
10	correct?	
11	A	I don't remember what he was wearing.
12	Q	You don't remember, one way or the other?
13	A	No.
14	Q	Were you in the car when the in the cruiser,
15	I'm sorry	, when the dispatch came over the air?
16	A	When they dispatched us?
17	Q	Yes.
18	A	Yes.
19	Q	Do you recall what, if any, description they gave
20	of alleged perpetrator?	
21		MR. SINSHEIMER: This is still for just
22	suppression.	
23	Q	BY MR. SINSHEIMER: Alleged?
24	A	At that time, no, I don't recall.
25	Q	You don't have any recollection whatsoever?
		7 P

35 1 Α No. If I refresh your recollection by saying someone 2 said something about red shirts, do you have any 3 recollection of that? 4 No. 5 Α 6 Q None whatsoever? 7 Α No. Now, as to -- after Mr. Ruidiaz is under arrest, 8 Q at some point you've testified on direct in the suppression 9 10 hearing that he was read his rights. Do you recall that 11 testimony? 12 Α Yes. Just because you didn't read him his rights, did 0 13 you? 14 No, I didn't. 15 Α And that ---16 Q MR. ARNOLD: Objection. Just for purposes of the 17 record, the statement about the reading of the rights was 18 not testimony just for a suppression hearing, but was part 19 20 of his testimony on direct. 21 MR. SINSHEIMER: Well, and I objected to it. 22 MR. ARNOLD: Agreed. 23 MR. SINSHEIMER: Right. I respect that, though. 24 If it was, I'm not going to try to dispute that. 25 0 BY MR. SINSHEIMER: In any event, let me -- you APEX Reporting

-	36
1	didn't personally read him his rights?
2	A No, I didn't.
3	Q Highland who did? Officer Highland?
4	A Officer Highland.
5	Q There was the three of you alone in the cruiser at
6	that time?
7	A Yes.
8	Q Was the cruiser moving?
9	A Yes.
10	Q Was my client behind a partition of some kind?
11	A The partitions in the cruiser are half plexiglas,
12	half wire cage, but, yes, he was behind those.
13	Q Okay. And were you driving or was Highland
14	driving?
15	A I was driving.
16	Q And you don't remember the exact words, if any,
17	that Mr. Ruidiaz used to acknowledge receipt of the rights?
18	A No.
19	Q In fact, your testimony really is, other than the
20	fact that you allege it happened, you don't recall anything
21	about the rights, correct?
22	A That's correct.
23	MR. SINSHEIMER: That's all I have of the
24	suppression.
25	MR. ARNOLD: Cross-examination on the suppression.
ı	APEX Reporting

37 MR. SINSHEIMER: Just on the suppression. 1 MR. ARNOLD: On the suppression. 2 MR. SINSHEIMER: Sure. 3 MR. ARNOLD: Redirect. 4 EXAMINATION BY MR. ARNOLD: 5 Quickly -- Officer Highland (sic), quickly review 6 7 what information you knew at the time that you and Officer Highland appeared at 126 French Avenue? 8 9 MR. SINSHEIMER: Objection to the word "knew." BY MR. ARNOLD: --- what information you had in 10 0 11 your possession. A green Mercedes. 12 A MR. SINSHEIMER: Information, I object again, but 13 I understand what you're doing. that's okay. 14 A green Mercedes parked in front of 126 French 15 Α Ave. was firing a gun at the house. 16 17 BY MR. ARNOLD: What time of night? Q About 12:30. Α 18 What was the information you had about the area? 19 Q 20 The information I had was a high-crime area based Α on its statistics and prior knowledge of the area, and being 21 identified as one of the areas the impact shift ---22 MR. SINSHEIMER: I object, and move to strike 23 I thought the question, information about the area, 24 meant that evening, not that general area. 25

38

1	on cross-	examination asked you questions about advice of
2	rights.	Is there anything that would refresh your
3	recollect	ion about any answer given by the defendant after
4	his advic	e of rights were given?
5	A	Yes. If I could read the report again?
6	Q	Showing you what's been marked as Government
7	Exhibit 7	
8		MR. SINSHEIMER: Only for ID in suppression, I
9	believe.	
10		MR. ARNOLD: Yes.
11	Q	BY MR. ARNOLD: Having reviewed Government's
12	Exhibit No	o. 7, does that refresh your recollection
13	A	Yes.
14	Q	about any statements made by the defendant
15	after rece	eiving his advice of rights?
16	A	Yes, it does.
17	Q	And what did the defend what did the defendant
18	say after	receiving his advice of rights?
19	A	He said, yeah, no shit.
20		MR. ARNOLD: No further questions.
21		MR. SINSHEIMER: I don't have anything else on
22	suppression	on.
23		MR. ARNOLD: Okay.

try to do this as a separate kind of trial cross, okay?

MR. SINSHEIMER: Let me ask a few. I'm going to

	40
1	MR. ARNOLD: Okay.
2	EXAMINATION BY MR. SINSHEIMER:
3	Q Officer, on the night that you assisted in the
4	arrest of Mr. Ruidiaz, you were dispatched to 126 French
5	Avenue
6	A Yes.
7	Q correct?
8	A Yes, sir.
9	Q When you arrived at 126 French Avenue, there
10	weren't any crimes being committed that you could see with
11	your own eyes, correct?
12	A Other than the vehicle parked in the wrong
13	direction, up on the sidewalk with a door open, no.
14	Q All right. And well, that's a civil violation,
15	that's not a crime, is it?
16	A It's a motor vehicle violation.
17	Q All right. And the and you didn't speak to
18	anyone before you approached the vehicle, did you?
19	A No.
20	Q And then you and your partner approached the
21	vehicle?
22	A Yes, sir.
23	Q And the person sitting in the passenger seat was
24	sitting there peacefully, correct?
25	A Yes.
ı	APEX Reporting

		41
1	Q	And then your partner reached in and grabbed him,
2	right?	
3	A	No, he reached in to check to see if he was okay.
4	Q	Yeah, but then very shortly thereafter he had him
5	on the gr	ound, right?
6	A	That's correct.
7	Q	And you say at that time, and for the first time
8	you obser	eved a weapon being taken from him?
9	A	I'm sorry, again?
10	Q	You observed a weapon being taken from him?
11	A	Yes.
12	Q	All right. Now, how long between the time you
13	approached the vehicle and in seconds and the weapon	
14	and you saw the weapon?	
15		I'll withdraw it and I'll try it again.
16		How much time in seconds elapsed between when you
17	first approached the vehicle and you had him on the ground	
18	and you s	aw the weapon?
19	A	In seconds?
20	Q	Yeah. Approximately?
21	A	I'd have to say about, less than two minutes.
22	Q	Okay. And in that time, another cruiser arrived,
23	correct?	
24	A	I was not aware of another cruiser arriving.
25	Q	Well, but
		A DETER Description of

		43
1	A	No.
2	Q	It's your testimony you have no knowledge of that,
3	whatsoeve	r?
4	A	That's correct.
5	:	MR. SINSHEIMER: No further questions.
6		EXAMINATION BY MR. ARNOLD:
7	Q	The information you had on hand was that shots had
8	been fire	d from a green Mercedes; is that correct?
9	A	Yes, sir.
10	Q	And when
11	A	In front of 126 French Avenue.
12	Q	In front of 126 French Avenue, and that came from
13	dispatch?	
14	A	That came from dispatch, yes.
15	Q	And it was 12:30 at night?
16	A	12:30 at night, yes.
17	Q	And you shone the flashlight in originally at the
18	green Mer	cedes that was illegally parked, the defendant did
19	not move?	
20	A	Yes.
21		MR. SINSHEIMER: Object to the object to the
22	question.	
23		MR. ARNOLD: No further questions.
24		MR. SINSHEIMER: I'm all set.
25		MR. ARNOLD: We're done?
		APEX Reporting (617) 426-3077

```
44
                MR. SINSHEIMER: Yes.
1
                (Whereupon, the deposition was concluded at
2
3
    3:01 p.m.)
                               APEX Reporting (617) 426-3077
```

CERTIFICATE

45

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS)
) SS.
COUNTY OF SUFFOLK)

I, Jeffrey H. Mocanu, a Court Reporter and Notary Public, within and for the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, do hereby certify that there came before me on this 19th day of July, 2006, the person hereinbefore named, who was by me duly sworn to tell the truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth, concerning and touching the matter in controversy in this cause; that he was thereupon examined upon his oath, and his examination reduced to typewriting, under my direction, and that this deposition transcript is a true and accurate record of the testimony given by the witness.

I further certify that I am not related to any of the parties hereto or their counsel, and that I am in no way interested in the outcome of said cause.

Dated at Boston, Massachusetts, this 1st day of August, 2006.

Jeffrey H. Mocanu

NOTARY PUBLIC

My Commission Expires:

COP

April 26, 2007